

Appendix 10.5 Assessment of Cumulative Effects



Table of contents

1 Assessment of Cumulative Effects

Error! Bookmark not defined.





Appendix 10.5 Assessment of Cumulative Effects (* denotes an assessment of a heritage asset utilising an alternative methodology than that provided in the individual windfarm environmental impact assessment report (EIAR) – see paragra

HA No.	Ref Number	Heritage Asset Name	Designation	Proposed Effect	Development	Consented or Proposed Windfarms Within 10	Magnitude of Impact	Description of Cumulative Impacts	Significance of Effect
					Significance				
Sche	duled Monume	ents							
39	SM2176	Kildoon Fort	Scheduled Monument	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Kirk Hill (consented)	Negligible Adverse	The cumulative impact on Kildoon Fort has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirkhill Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm	Slight Adverse
			Monument	Auveise	Auverse	Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse*	(application), and the Proposed Development.	Auverse
								Impacts from all three windfarms within 10km of the fort have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as no key views would be impacted by any of the developments. The cumulative impact would result in very minor changes to the setting of the fort, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
63	SM5200	Munteoch	Scheduled	Negligible	Slight	South Kyle (consented)	No Change		Slight
		Settlement and Field	Monument	Adverse	Adverse	Benbrack (consented)	No Change		Adverse
		Systems				North Kyle (application)	No Change		
						Knockcronal (scoping)	Negligible Adverse	Impacts from the South Kyle, Benbrack, and North Kyle Windfarms are assessed as having No Change to the setting of the settlement and field systems as they are unlikely to be visible.	
								Impacts from the Knockcronal Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse with very minor changes to setting with the introduction of blade tips and hubs in distant and peripheral views to the south west.	
								Cumulatively, there would be very minor changes to the setting of the settlement and field systems due to the Proposed Development, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
75	SM316	Dalquharran Castle (Old Castle)	Scheduled Monument	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Kirk Hill (consented)	No Change	The cumulative impact on Dalquharran Castle (Old Castle) has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping) and the Proposed Development.	Slight Adverse
						Tralorg (consented)	No Change	Impacts from the Kirk Hill, Tralorg and Knockcronal Windfarms are assessed as having No Change to the setting of the castle as they are unlikely to be visible.	
						Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse	Impacts from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse with very minor changes to setting with the introduction of blade tips and hubs within the same distant and peripheral views to the south east, with Craiginmoddie Windfarm in the forefront of those views.	
						Knockronal (scoping)	No Change	Cumulatively, there would be very minor changes to the setting of the castle, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
84	SM7491	Knockdon	Scheduled	Minor	Slight	South Kyle (consented)	No Change	The cumulative impact on Knockdon Enclosure has taken into account the current baseline	Slight
		Enclosure	Monument	Adverse	Adverse	Benbrack (consented)	No Change	scenario, and includes the addition of the South Kyle Windfarm (consented), the Benbrack	Adverse
						Knockcronal (scoping)	Minor Adverse	Windfarm (consented), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development.	
								Impacts from the South Kyle and Benbrack Windfarms are assessed as having No Change to the setting of the enclosures as they are unlikely to be visible.	

aph	158)
apri	100)

HA No.	Ref Number	Heritage Asset Name	Designation	Effect	Development Significance	Windfarms Within 10	Magnitude of Impact	Description of Cumulative Impacts	Significance of Effect
								Impacts from the Knockcronal Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Minor Adverse with slight changes to setting with the introduction of blade tips and hubs within distant views to the south west. These views may be impacted upon by localised vegetation and the changes would not impact on the ability to understand and appreciate the enclosure. Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the enclosure, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
89	SM3357	Knockinculloch Enclosures	Scheduled Monument	Moderate Adverse	Moderate Adverse	Kirkhill (consented) Craiginmoddie (application) Knockcronal (scoping)	No Change Minor Adverse Minor Adverse	The cumulative impact on Knockinculloch Enclosures has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirkhill Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development. Impacts from the Kirkhill Windfarm are assessed as having No Change to the setting of the enclosures as they are unlikely to be visible. Impacts from the Craiginmoddie and Knockcronal Windfarms have been assessed as Minor Adverse with slight changes to setting with the introduction of blade tips and hubs in potential key views to the south west and south east respectively. Impacts from the Proposed Development would remain as previously stated, assessed as Moderate Adverse with the blade tips and hubs of the Proposed Development visible in immediate views to the south and more distant views to the south east (see Figure 10.5 Viewpoint 25: Knockinculloch Enclosures). The changes would be in the context of a backdrop of commercial forestry and intervening localised vegetation which may have minor impacts on these views from various locations around the enclosures but may impact upon the ability to appreciate them within the upland landscape within which they are situated. Cumulatively, there would be considerable changes to the setting of the enclosures, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Moderate Adverse.	Adverse
94	SM2201	Maxwellston Hill Fort	Scheduled Monument	Minor Adverse	Slight Adverse	Kirk Hill (consented) Tralorg (consented) Clauchrie (application) Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse No Change Negligible Adverse Minor Adverse	 The cumulative impact on Maxwellston Hill Fort has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Clauchrie Windfarm (application), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), and the Proposed Development. Impacts from the Tralorg Windfarm are assessed as having No Change to the setting of the hill fort as they are unlikely to be visible. Impacts from the Kirk Hill and Clauchrie Windfarms are assessed as Negligible Adverse with very minor changes to the setting of the hill fort with the introduction of blade tips and hubs in distant views. Impacts from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm and the Proposed Development are assessed as Minor Adverse with slight changes to the setting with the introduction of blade tips and hubs within the same distant and peripheral views to the east (see Figure 10.11 Viewpoint 30: Maxwellston Hill Fort). Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the fort, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse. 	

HA No.	Ref Number	Heritage Asset Name	Designation	Effect	Development Significance	Consented or Proposed Windfarms Within 10 kilometres (km)	Magnitude of Impact	Description of Cumulative Impacts	Significance of Effect
Liste	d Buildings								
30	LB13654	Kirkmichael	Category B	Negligible	Slight	Kirk Hill (consented)	Negligible Adverse	The cumulative impact on Kirkmichael House has taken into account the current baseline	Slight
		House	Listed Building	Adverse	Adverse	Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse*	scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development.	Adverse
						Knockcronal (scoping)	Negligible Adverse	Impacts from all four windfarms within 10km of the house have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as no key views would be impacted by any of the developments. The cumulative impact would result in very minor changes to the setting of the house, with significant filtering and screening of the wind turbines, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
40	LB14277	Sir Charles Fergusson's Monument,	Category B Listed Building	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Kirk Hill (consented)	Negligible Adverse	The cumulative impact on Sir Charles Fergusson's Monument has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), and the Proposed Development.	Slight Adverse
		Kildoon				Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse*	Impacts from all three windfarms within 10km of the monument has been assessed as Negligible Adverse as no key views would be impacted by any of the developments. The cumulative impact would result in very minor changes to the setting of the monument, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
46	LB19094	4 Blairquhan House	Category A Listed Building	Negligible	Slight	Kirk Hill (consented)	No Change	The cumulative impact on Blairquhan House has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie	Slight
				Adverse	Adverse	Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse*	Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development.	Adverse
						Knockcronal (scoping)	Negligible Adverse	Impacts from the Kirk Hill Windfarm have been assessed as No Change to the setting of the house as visibility would be minimal.	
								Impacts from the Craiginmoddie and Knockcronal windfarms, and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse due to the visibility of the turbines in the background of views from the north towards the house (see Figure 10.16 Viewpoint 35: Blarquhan (from Kings Hill). The cumulative impact would result in very minor changes to the setting of the house therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	,
62	LB19104	Colonel Hunter Blair's Monument	Category B Listed Building	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse*	The cumulative impact on Colonel Hunter Blair's Monument has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development.	Slight Adverse
								Impacts from the three windfarms within 10km of the monument have been assessed as - Negligible Adverse as neither would impact upon any key views (see Figure 5.24 Viewpoint 8 :	
						Knockcronal (scoping)	Negligible Adverse	Colonel Hunter Blair Monument). The cumulative impact would result in very minor changes the setting of the monument, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse.	
74	LB125	Dalquharran Castle	Category A Listed Building	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Kirk Hill (consented)	No Change	The cumulative impact on Dalquharran Castle has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), and the Proposed Development.	Slight Adverse

	er Heritage	Designation		Development		Magnitude of Impact	Description of Cumulative Impacts	Significanc
No.	Asset Name		Effect Magnitude	Significance	Windfarms Within 10 kilometres (km)			of Effect
					Tralorg (consented)	No Change	Impacts from the Kirk Hill and Tralorg Windfarms have been assessed as No Change to the setting of the castle as they are unlikely to be visible.	
				Craiginmoddie (application)	Moderate Adverse	Impacts from the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as it would not impact on any key views (see Figure 10.14 Viewpoint 33: Dalquharran Castle). Impacts from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm have been assessed within the Craiginmoddie Windfarm Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) as Moderate Adverse as the windfarm would appear at distance in wider landscape views which contribute to its setting. This has been assessed to result in either a substantial change to the key characteristics of the castle setting or make a significant alteration to those elements of the setting which directly contribute to the understanding of the cultural value of the castle. It should be noted that the impact on Dalquharran Castle of Moderate Adverse is a result of the methodology used in the Craiginmoddie Windfarm assessment. The introduction of the Craiginmoddie Windfarm in wider landscape views from the castle would result in impacts on a key element of its setting. However, as agreed with Historic Environment Scotland (HES) in their consultation response to Craiginmoddie Windfarm application, this impact would not create a significance of effect that would be significant in EIA terms. Therefore, when considering the differences in methodology and bringing the Craiginmoddie Windfarm impact in line with the methodology set out above, the magnitude of impact should be stated as Minor Adverse due to the impact on a single key view from the castle, resulting in a significance of effect of Slight Adverse rather than Moderate Adverse, and therefore not significant in EIA terms. Consequently, the cumulative impact of the addition of the Proposed Development to a baseline along with consented and application developments would result in slight changes to the setting of the castle due to the impact from Craiginmoddie Windfarm, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse.		
-	ns and Designed		N A ¹ a a a					Olivit
43 GDL00063	8 Blairquhan	Garden and Designed Landscape	Minor Adverse	Slight Adverse	Kirk Hill (consented) Craiginmoddie	Negligible Adverse	The cumulative impact on Blairquhan GDL has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development.	Slight Adverse
		(GDL)			(application) Knockcronal (scoping)	Minor Adverse	Impacts from the Kirk Hill and Craiginmoddie Windfarms have been assessed as Negligible Adverse. Kirk Hill Windfarm would be visible but would not impact on any key views. Craiginmoddie Windfarm would be present in the same key view as Knockcronal Windfarm and the Proposed Development but the assessment states that there would be minor changes to the setting of the GDL which do not affect the key characteristics.	5
							Minor Adverse as there would be slight changes to setting with the introduction of blade tips and hubs within the same distant views to the south. These views may be impacted upon by localised vegetation and the changes would not impact on the ability to understand and appreciate the policies of the GDL (see Figure 10.16 Viewpoint 35: Blairquhan (from Kings Hill). Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the GDL, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse.	

43	GDL00063	Blairquhan	Garden and Designed	Minor Adverse	Slight Adverse	Kirk Hill (consented)	Negligible Adverse	The cumulative impact on Blairquhan GDL has taken into a and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (conser
			Landscape (GDL)			Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse	(application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the
						Knockcronal (scoping)	Minor Adverse	Impacts from the Kirk Hill and Craiginmoddie Windfarms h Adverse. Kirk Hill Windfarm would be visible but would not Craiginmoddie Windfarm would be present in the same ke the Proposed Development but the assessment states tha setting of the GDL which do not affect the key characteristic Impacts from the Knockcronal Windfarm and the Propose Minor Adverse as there would be slight changes to setting hubs within the same distant views to the south. These vie vegetation and the changes would not impact on the ability policies of the GDL (see Figure 10.16 Viewpoint 35: Blain
								Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .

HA No.	Ref Number	Heritage Asset Name	Designation	Effect	Development Significance	Consented or Proposed Windfarms Within 10 kilometres (km)	Magnitude of Impact	Description of Cumulative Impacts	Significance of Effect
61	GDL00111	Craigengillan	Garden and Designed Landscape	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	South Kyle (consented) Benbrack (consented) Overhill (consented) Enoch Hill (consented) North Kyle (application) Windy Standard 3 (application) Knockcronal (scoping)	Negligible AdverseNegligible AdverseNegligible AdverseNegligible AdverseNegligible AdverseNegligible AdverseNegligible AdverseNegligible Adverse	 The cumulative impact on Craigengillan GDL has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of South Kyle Windfarm (consented), Benbrack Windfarm (consented), Overhill Windfarm (consented), Enoch Hill Windfarm (consented), North Kyle Windfarm (application), Windy Standard 3 Windfarm (application), Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development. Impacts from all eight windfarms within 10km of the GDL have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as none of the windfarms would impact on any key views individually (see Figure 10.15 Viewpoint 34: Craigengillan GDL / Auchenroy Hill Cairn). However, cumulatively, the number of impacts would provide a greater cumulative magnitude of impact, resulting in slight changes to the setting of the GDL, although the changes would not impact on the ability to understand and appreciate the GDL. Therefore, the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse. 	Slight Adverse
67	GDL00238	Kilkerran	Inventory Garden and Designed Landscape	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Kirk Hill (consented) Tralorg (consented) Craiginmoddie (application) Knockcronal (scoping)	Negligible AdverseNo ChangeNegligible AdverseNo Change	 The cumulative impact on Kilkerran GDL has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development. Impacts from the Tralorg Windfarm and Knockcronal Windfarm have been assessed as No Change to the setting of the GDL as they are unlikely to be visible. Impacts from the Kirk Hill and Craiginmoddie Windfarms, and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse. The Kirk Hill Windfarm and the Proposed Development would not impact on key views from or towards the GDL (see Figure 10.6 Viewpoint 26a: Kilkerran (B741) and Figure 10.7 Viewpoint 26b: Kilkerran (east of Aird Bridge)). The Craiginmoddie Windfarm would be visible from the viewpoints provided but is assessed as producing minor or very minor changes to its setting that do not affect the key characteristics. Cumulatively, there would be very minor changes to the setting of the GDL, therefore the cumulative significance of effect on the GDL would be Slight Adverse. 	Slight Adverse
87	GDL00047	Bargany	Garden and Designed Landscape	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Kirk Hill (consented) Tralorg (consented) Craiginmoddie (application)	Minor Adverse No Change Negligible Adverse	 The cumulative eigninearies of effect on the CDL would be Origin Acterise. The cumulative impact on Bargany GDL has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), and the Proposed Development. Impacts from the Tralorg Windfarm have been assessed as No Change to the setting of the GDL as they are unlikely to be visible. Impacts from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they are situated within the same viewshed and would not impact on any key views from or towards the GDL (see Figure 10.17 Viewpoint 36: Bargany House GDL). Impacts from the Kirk Hill Windfarm have been assessed as Minor Adverse as the introduction of blade tips and hubs may impact on views from the south of the policies. These views are likely to be part filtered by localised topography and vegetation and would not impact on the ability to understand and appreciate the GDL Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the GDL, therefore, the cumulative significance of effect on the GDL would be Slight Adverse. 	Slight Adverse

HA No.	Ref Number	Heritage Asset Name	Designation	Effect	Development Significance	Windfarms Within 10	Magnitude of Impact	Description of Cumulative Impacts	Significance of Effect
Cons	ervation Areas	5							
115	CA80	Barr	Conservation		Slight	Tralorg (consented)	No Change	The cumulative impact on Barr has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes	
			Area	Adverse	Adverse	Clauchrie (application)	Negligible Adverse	the addition of the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Clauchrie Windfarm (application), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), and the Proposed Development.	Adverse
						Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse*	Impacts from the Tralorg Windfarm have been assessed as No Change to the setting of the village as they are unlikely to be visible.	
								Impacts from the Clauchrie and Craiginmoddie Windfarms, and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they would have no impact on key views, with the blade tips and hubs only visible from the northern most properties on Glenginnet Road.	
								Cumulatively, there would be very minor changes to the setting of the Conservation Area, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
Ayrsł	nire Designed I	Landscapes							
59	WoSAS Pin	Dalquharran	Ayrshire	Negligible	Slight	Kirk Hill (consented)	No Change	The cumulative impact on the Dalguharran (Castle) Designed landscape has taken into account	Slight
	53485	(Castle)	Designed Landscape	Adverse	Adverse	Tralorg (consented)	No Change	the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development.	
						Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse*		
						Knockcronal (scoping)		Impacts from the Kirk Hill, Tralorg, and Knockcronal Windfarms have been assessed as No Change to the setting of the landscape as they are unlikely to be visible.	
									Impacts from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they would have no impact on any key views to or from the designed landscape (see Figure 10.14 Viewpoint 33: Dalquharran Castle).
								Cumulatively, there would be very minor changes to the setting of the designed landscape, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
Inde	signated Asse	ts of National	Significance	,	•	1			
0	WoSAS Pin	Auchenrov Hill	Undesignated	Negligible	Slight	South Kyle (consented)	Negligible Adverse	The cumulative impact on Auchenroy Hill Cairn has taken into account the current baseline	Slight
-		Cairn	Asset of	Adverse	Adverse	Benbrack (consented)	Minor Adverse	scenario, and includes the addition of the South Kyle Windfarm (consented), the Benbrack	Adverse
			National Significance			. ,		Windfarm (consented), the Overhill Windfarm (consented), the North Kyle Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm, and the Proposed Development.	
			Significance			Overhill (consented)	Negligible Adverse		
						North Kyle (application)	Negligible Adverse*	Impacts from the South Kyle, Overhill, North Kyle, Knockcronal Windfarms, and the Proposed Development have all been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they would have no impact on	
						Knockcronal (scoping)	Negligible Adverse	any key views from the cairn (see Figure 10.15 Viewpoint 34: Craigengillan GDL / Auchenroy Hill Cairn).	
								Impacts from the Benbrack Windfarm have been assessed as potentially Minor Adverse as it may impact upon a potential key view between Auchenroy Hill Cairn and Wee Cairn Hill Cairn, but the changes would not impact on the ability to understand and appreciate the cairn.	
							Cu	Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the cairn, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
						South Kyle (consented)	Negligible Adverse		

HA No.	Ref Number	Heritage Asset Name	Designation	Effect	Development Significance	Consented or Proposed Windfarms Within 10 kilometres (km)	Magnitude of Impact	Description of Cumulative Impacts	Significance of Effect
	WoSAS Pin 7162	Wee Cairn Hill Cairn	Undesignated Asset of National Significance	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Benbrack (consented) Overhill (consented) Enoch Hill (consented) North Kyle (application) Knockcronal (scoping)	Minor Adverse Negligible Adverse Negligible Adverse* Negligible Adverse	 The cumulative impact on Wee Cairn Hill Cairn has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the South Kyle Windfarm (consented), the Benbrack Windfarm (consented), the Overhill Windfarm (consented), the Enoch Hill Windfarm (consented), the North Kyle Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development. Impacts from South Kyle, Overhill, Enoch Hill, North Kyle, Knockcronal, Windfarms and the Proposed Development have all been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they would have no impact on any key views from the cairn. Impacts from the Benbrack Windfarm have been assessed as potentially Minor Adverse as it may impact upon a potential key view between Auchenroy Hill Cairn and Wee Cairn Hill Cairn, but the changes would not impact on the ability to understand and appreciate the cairn. Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the cairn, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse. 	Slight Adverse
65	WoSAS Pin 5453	Quarrel Hill Farmstead	Undesignated Asset of National Significance	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Kirk Hill (consented) Tralorg (consented) Craiginmoddie (application)	No Change No Change Negligible Adverse*	The cumulative impact on Quarrel Hill Farmstead has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), and the Proposed Development. Impacts from Kirk Hill and Tralorg Windfarms have been assessed as No Change to the setting of the farmstead as they are unlikely to be visible. Impacts from Craiginmoddie Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they would have no impact on any key views from the farmstead. Cumulatively, there would be very minor changes to the setting of the farmstead, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	Slight Adverse
71	WoSAS Pin 7195	Baing Loch Chambered Cairn	Undesignated Asset of National Significance	Minor Adverse	Slight Adverse	Craiginmoddie (application) Knockcronal (scoping)	Negligible Adverse*	 The cumulative impact on Baing Loch Chambered Cairn has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development. Impacts from Craiginmoddie Windfarm have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they would have no impact on key views from the cairn. Impacts from the Knockcronal Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Minor Adverse as the blade tips and hubs would be visible within the distant views to the south west beyond the slopes of Big Hill of Baing (see Figure 10.8 Viewpoint 27: Baing Loch Chambered Cairn). These changes are unlikely to impact on the ability to understand and appreciate the cairn and its association with the Chapel Burn. Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the cairn, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse. 	Slight Adverse
76						Kirk Hill (consented)	No Change		

HA No.	Ref Number	Heritage Asset Name	Designation	Effect	Development Significance	Consented or Proposed Windfarms Within 10 kilometres (km)	Magnitude of Impact	Description of Cumulative Impacts	Significance of Effect					
	WoSAS Pin 5445	Dalquharran Colliery Cropmarks	Undesignated Asset of National Significance	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Tralorg (consented) Craiginmoddie (application)	No Change Negligible Adverse*	The cumulative impact on Dalquharran Colliery Cropmarks has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), and the Proposed Development.	Slight Adverse					
								setting of the cropmarks as they are unlikely to be visible. Impacts from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they would not impact upon any key views from the cropmark location. Cumulatively, there would be very minor changes to the setting of the cropmarks, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .						
85		Maxwellston	Undesignated	Negligible		Kirk Hill (consented)	Negligible Adverse	The cumulative impact on Maxwellston Enclosure has taken into account the current baseline	Slight					
	5450	Enclosure	Asset of National	Adverse	Adverse	Tralorg (consented)	No Change scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), and the Proposed Development.	Adverse						
			Significance			Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse*	Impacts from the Tralorg Windfarm have been assessed as No Change to the setting of the enclosure as they are unlikely to be visible.						
								Impacts from the Kirk Hill, and Craiginmoddie Windfarms, and the Proposed Development, have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they would not impact on any key views from the enclosure.						
													Cumulatively, there would be very minor changes to the setting of the enclosure, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
88	WoSAS Pin 6128	Knockoner Burn Farmstead	Undesignated Asset of National Significance	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Craiginmoddie (application)	No Change*	The cumulative impact on Knockoner Burn Farmstead has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development.	Slight Adverse					
								the farmstead as they are unlikely to be visible.						
								Impacts from the Knockcronal Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as						
						Knockcronal (scoping)	Negligible Adverse	Negligible Adverse, with no impacts on any key views from the farmstead.						
								Cumulatively, there would be very minor changes to the setting of the farmstead, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .						
90	WoSAS Pin 12754	The Pilot/Blair House	Undesignated Asset of	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Kirk Hill (consented)	Negligible Adverse	The cumulative impact on the Pilot/Blair House Platform has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirkhill Windfarm (consented), the	Slight Adverse					
		Platform	National Significance				Moderate Adverse*	Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm, and the Proposed Development.						
			Significanoc			(application) Knockcronal (scoping)	No Change							
						(), (Impacts from the Knockcronal Windfarm have been assessed as No Change as it is unlikely to be visible.						

HA No.	Ref Number	Heritage Asset Name	Designation	Effect	Development Significance	Consented or Proposed Windfarms Within 10 kilometres (km)	Magnitude of Impact	Description of Cumulative Impacts	Significance of Effect
								Impacts from the Kirk Hill Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they would have no impact on key views from the house. Impacts from Craiginmoddie Windfarm have been assessed as Moderate Adverse due to the positioning of the windfarm infrastructure on the slopes to the immediate south. The introduction of wind turbines in close proximity would result in changes to the setting of the house. Cumulatively, there would be slight visual changes to the setting of the house with a small extension to the array of visible turbines at a distance to the south-east, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
105	WoSAS Pin 12033	Daljedburgh Hill Huts	Undesignated Asset of National Significance	Minor Adverse	Slight Adverse	Kirk Hill (consented) Tralorg (consented) Clauchrie (application) Craiginmoddie (application) Knockcronal (scoping)	No Change No Change No Change Minor Adverse* Negligible Adverse	The cumulative impact on Daljedburgh Hill Huts has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Clauchrie Windfarm (application), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development. Impacts from Kirk Hill, Tralorg, and Clauchrie Windfarms have been assessed as No Change to the setting of the huts as they are unlikely to be visible. Impacts from Knockcronal Windfarm have been assessed as Negligible Adverse with very minor changes to setting from the introduction of blade tips and hubs in distant views to the north east. Impacts from Craiginmoddie Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Minor Adverse, with slight changes to setting from the introduction of blade tips and hubs in blade tips and hubs in views to the east and the north. Localised topography and vegetation is likely to impact on these views and these changes are unlikely to impact on the ability to understand and appreciate the huts. Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the huts, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	Slight Adverse
108	WoSAS Pin 12021	Dalquhairn Cairn	Undesignated Asset of National Significance	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Tralorg (consented) Clauchrie (application) Craiginmoddie (application) Knockcronal (scoping)	No Change No Change Minor Adverse* Negligible Adverse	 The cumulative impact on Dalquhairn Cairn has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Clauchrie Windfarm (application), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development. Impacts from Tralorg and Clauchrie Windfarms have been assessed as No Change on the setting of the cairn as they are unlikely to be visible. Impacts from the Knockcronal Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as there would be no impact on any key views from the introduction of blade tips and hubs within distant views to the north east. Impacts from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm have been assessed as Minor Adverse as a single wind turbine would be visible on the hill behind the possibly contemporary site of Daljedburgh huts. Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the cairn due to the Minor Adverse impact from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse. 	Adverse

HA No.	Ref Number	Heritage Asset Name	Designation	Effect	Development Significance	Consented or Proposed Windfarms Within 10 kilometres (km)	Magnitude of Impact	Description of Cumulative Impacts	Significance of Effect
109	WoSAS Pin	Knockeen	Undesignated	Negligible	Slight	Tralorg (consented)	No Change	The cumulative impact on Knockeen Cairn has taken into account the current baseline scenario,	Slight
	12023	Cairn	Asset of National	Adverse	Adverse	Clauchrie (application)	No Change	and includes the addition of the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Clauchrie Windfarm (application), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping),	Adverse
			Significance			Craiginmoddie (application)	Minor Adverse*	and the Proposed Development.	
						Knockcronal (scoping)	Negligible Adverse	Impacts from Tralorg and Clauchrie Windfarms have been assessed as No Change on the setting of the cairn as they are unlikely to be visible.	
								Impacts from the Knockcronal Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as there would be no impact on any key views from the introduction of blade tips and hubs within distant views to the north east.	
								Impacts from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm have been assessed as Minor Adverse as wind turbines would be visible on the hill behind the possibly contemporary site of Daljedburgh huts.	
								Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the cairn due to the Minor Adverse impact from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
110	WoSAS Pin 12024	Pinvalley Dun/Cairn	Undesignated Asset of	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Clauchrie (application)	No Change	The cumulative impact on Pinvalley Dun/Cairn has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Clauchrie Windfarm (application), the Craiginmoddie	Slight Adverse
			National Significance			Craiginmoddie (application)	Minor Adverse*	Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development. Impacts from the Clauchrie and Knockcronal Windfarms have been assessed as No Change on the setting of the dun/cairn as they are unlikely to be visible.	
						Knockcronal (scoping)	No Change		
								Impacts from the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as there would be no impact on any key views from the introduction of blade tips and hubs within distant views to the north east.	
								Impacts from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm have been assessed as Minor Adverse as wind turbines would be visible on the hills to the north behind potential contemporary sites.	
								Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the cairn due to the Minor Adverse impact from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
111		Glengennet	Undesignated	Negligible	Slight	Kirk Hill (consented)	No Change	The cumulative impact on the Glengennet Farmstead and Kiln has taken into account the current	Slight
	11568	Farmstead and Kiln	Asset of National	Adverse	Adverse	Tralorg (consented)	No Change	baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Clauchrie Windfarm (application), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm	Adverse
			Significance			Clauchrie (application)	Negligible Adverse	(application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development.	
						Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse*	Impacts from the Kirk Hill, Tralorg, and Knockcronal Windfarms have been assessed as No	
						Knockcronal (scoping)	No Change	Change on the setting of the farmstead as they are unlikely to be visible.	
								Impacts from Clauchrie and Craiginmoddie Windfarms, and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they would not impact on any key views from the farmstead.	
								Cumulatively, there would be very minor changes to the setting of the farmstead, therefore, the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	

HA No.	Ref Number	Heritage Asset Name	Designation	Effect	Development Significance	Consented or Proposed Windfarms Within 10 kilometres (km)	Magnitude of Impact	Description of Cumulative Impacts	Significance of Effect
112	WoSAS Pin 11675	Bencallen Cairn	Undesignated Asset of National	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Clauchrie (application)	No Change	The cumulative impact on Bencallen Cairn has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Clauchrie Windfarm (application), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development.	Slight Adverse
			Significance			Craiginmoddie (application)	Minor Adverse*		
						Knockcronal (scoping)	No Change	Impacts from Clauchrie and Knockcronal Windfarms have been assessed as No Change on the setting of the cairn as they are unlikely to be visible.	
								Impacts from the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they would not impact on any key views from the cairn.	
								Impacts from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm have been assessed as Minor Adverse due to the introduction of wind turbines in views to the north into the Stinchar Valley and the other contemporary heritage assets.	
								Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the cairn due to the Minor Adverse impact from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm, therefore, the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
117	WoSAS Pin 11676	Pinbreck Hill Cairn	Undesignated Asset of National	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Clauchrie (application)	No Change	The cumulative impact on Pinbreck Hill Cairn has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Clauchrie Windfarm (application), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development.	Slight Adverse
			Significance			Craiginmoddie (application)	Minor Adverse*		
					Knockcronal (scoping)	Negligible Adverse	Impacts from Clauchrie Windfarm have been assessed as No Change on the setting of the cairn as they are unlikely to be visible.		
								Impacts from the Proposed Development and Knockcronal Windfarm have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they would not impact on any key views from the cairn.	
								Impacts from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm have been assessed as Minor Adverse due to the introduction of wind turbines to the current array of operational windfarms that range from a westerly to north westerly viewshed (see Figure 10.9 Viewpoint 28: Pinbreck Hill Cairn). These changes are unlikely to impact on the ability to understand the fabric and nature of the Cairn.	
								Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the cairn due to the Minor Adverse impact from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm, therefore, the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	
120	WoSAS Pin 11677	Cairn Hill Cairn	Undesignated Asset of	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Clauchrie (application)	Moderate Adverse	The cumulative impact on Cairn Hill Cairn has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Clauchrie Windfarm (application), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm	Slight Adverse
			National Significance			Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse*	(application), and the Proposed Development. Impacts from the Craiginmoddie Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed	
								as Negligible Adverse as they would only appear in distant and peripheral views and would not impact on key views from the cairn.	
								Impacts from the Clauchrie Windfarm have been assessed as Moderate Adverse with the close proximity of the wind turbines impacting upon the setting of the cairn.	
								Cumulatively, there would be slight visual changes to the setting of the cairn with a small extension to the array of visible turbines at a distance to the north-east, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .	

HA No.	Ref Number	Heritage Asset Name	Designation	Effect	Development Significance	Consented or Proposed Windfarms Within 10 kilometres (km)	Magnitude of Impact	Description of Cumulative Impacts	Significance of Effect	
Unde	Undesignated Assets of Regional Significance									
	WoSAS Pin 6139	Mote of the Doonan's Dun	Undesignated Asset of Regional Significance	Minor Adverse	Slight Adverse	Craiginmoddie (application)	Minor Adverse*	The cumulative impact on the Mote of Doonan's Dun has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development. Impacts from the three windfarms have been assessed as Minor Adverse due to the impacts on the key view to the south west over Doonan's Hill Fort (see Figure 10.10 Viewpoint 29: Mote of	Slight Adverse	
						Knockcronal (scoping)	Minor Adverse	Doonan's Dun). Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the dun, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .		
70	WoSAS Pin 6135	Doonan's Hill Fort	Undesignated Asset of National Significance	Minor Adverse	Slight Adverse	Craiginmoddie (application)	Minor Adverse*	The cumulative impact on Doonan's Hill Fort has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), The Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development.	Slight Adverse	
						Knockcronal (scoping)	Minor Adverse	the key view from the north east towards the fort. Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the fort, therefore the cumula significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .		
86	WoSAS Pin 7196	Knockdon Cairn	Undesignated Asset of	Minor Adverse	Slight Adverse	South Kyle (consented)	No Change	The cumulative impact on Knockdon Cairn has taken into account the current baseline scenario, and includes the addition of the South Kyle Windfarm (consented), the Benbrack Windfarm	Slight Adverse	
			Regional Significance			Benbrack (consented)	No Change	(consented), the Knockcronal Windfarm (scoping), and the Proposed Development.		
			5			Knockcronal (scoping)	Minor Adverse	Impacts from the South Kyle and Benbrack Windfarms have been assessed as No Change to the setting of the cairn as they are unlikely to be visible.		
								Impacts from the Knockcronal Windfarm and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Minor Adverse with the introduction of blade tips and hubs in distant and peripheral views to the south west.		
								Cumulatively, there would be slight changes to the setting of the cairn, therefore the cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse .		
	WoSAS	Auchensoul	Undesignated	Negligible Adverse	Slight Adverse	Kirk Hill (consented)	No Change	The cumulative impact on Auchensoul Cairn has taken into account the current baseline	Slight	
	Pin11632	Hill Cairn	Asset of Regional Significance			Tralorg (consented)	No Change	scenario, and includes the addition of the Kirk Hill Windfarm (consented), the Tralorg Windfarm (consented), the Clauchrie Windfarm (application), the Craiginmoddie Windfarm (application), and	Adverse	
						Clauchrie (application) Craiginmoddie (application)	Negligible Adverse Negligible Adverse*	the Proposed Development.		
								Impacts from the Kirk Hill and Tralorg Windfarms have been assessed as No Change to the setting of the cairn as they are unlikely to be visible.		
I								Impacts from Clauchrie and Craiginmoddie Windfarms, and the Proposed Development have been assessed as Negligible Adverse as they would not impact upon any key views from the cairn.		

HA No	er Heritage Asset Name	 Effect	Consented or Proposed Windfarms Within 10 kilometres (km)	Magnitude of Impact	Description of Cumulative Impacts
					Cumulatively, there would be very minor changes to the se cumulative significance of effect would be Slight Adverse

	Significance of Effect
setting of the cairn, therefore the e .	

Carrick Windfarm Project Team

ScottishPower Renewables 9th Floor ScottishPower Headquarters 320 St Vincent Street Glasgow G2 5AD

CarrickWindfarm@scottishpower.com



